GATS undermines sustainable development in tourism

Commentary by Christina Kamp – German Forum

"International trade agreements are not discussed or debated by the people who will be affected by such agreements. They are geared to the industry and governments, yet are implemented at the local level. This undermines and threatens the autonomy and participation of local communities and indigenous peoples," Nina Rao of EQUATIONS in India stated.

Chairman Simon Upton acknowledged the evident collision between the World Trade Organisation on the one hand and sustainable development, Agenda 21 and local development on the other to be included in the report as an outcome of the dialogue session.

NGOs voiced serious concern with regard to the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) during the Dialogue Session on Community Development. The agreement under the auspices of the World Trade Organisation (WTO OMC) aims at increasing liberalisation in several areas of travel and tourism related services.

NGO SUMMARY
NGOs emphasized their concerns in summing up the Dialogue Sessions and challenged CSD-7 to deal with the issue of trade liberalisation and its implications for sustainable development in tourism.

As a concrete step, NGOs suggested amending GATS Art. XIX.2 to take account of the general and special needs of local communities and regions in the liberalisation process as well as the national political goals and level of development of the individual member states.

IMPROVED PROPOSALS
In a study commissioned by EQUATIONS/India and Tourism Watch/Germany on GATS and Tourism, a number of further proposals are being outlined which should be considered in the discussion:

- As long as the prices of tourist services do not properly reflect environmental user and damage costs, there is no reliable basis for optimism regarding the economic effects of continuing liberalisation. Establishing suitable accounting systems should take preference over further negotiations on dismantling trade barriers. The current work of the World Tourism Organisation (WTO-OMT) on improving national economic accounting in relation to tourism should be linked to environmental accounting and assessment schemes, such as the UN System of Environmental and Economic Accounting (SEEA).

- Existing international environmental standards, e.g. the Convention on Biological Diversity, should not be...
Outcome of dialogue on influencing consumer behavior

NGOs view
The NGOs were keen to see full stakeholder participation in schemes to influence consumer behavior, but were slightly skeptical about how far industry would allow this process. They again emphasized the need for local communities to be involved in drawing up guidelines for consumer behavior, and for consumer education. They stressed that health and gender issues should be addressed in planning for sustainable tourism. They believed that Eco-labeling which has been suggested must include social and economic norms as well as environmental ones.

Trade Unions
They supported the idea of voluntary initiatives and agreements in the tourism industry, and will be meeting the business stakeholders. In future meetings they would be emphasizing the importance of training the labor forces for sustainable tourism. In terms of influencing the traveler, they believe that the non-management worker is best placed to do so, so should be equipped with the relevant tools. They welcomed the positive outcome in the discussion the part of all stakeholders, but said that from the workers’ point of view sustainable tourism could only occur if workplaces were sustainable, which means the industry should agree to bring in basic labor standards.

(GATS undermines... cont)
undermined by the WTO-OMC agreement.

The commitment of the World Trade Organisation to environment and resource protection should be supplemented by procedural standards with the same status as the principles of Market Access and National Treatment. This could be done by adding another trade standard in connection with a further exception to the principle of Most Favoured Nation Treatment in accordance with GATT Art. XX as was done in the Maastricht Treaty. It should be guaranteed that these changes take effect in all three areas of negotiation (goods, services, intellectual property rights).

- Standards have to be developed guarding extraterritorial goods adversely affected by cross border trade.

- In order to avert the possible expansion of a strategic trade policy widening the technology gap, regulating competition must be introduced multilaterally, guaranteeing transparency of government policy on competition and industry, and allowing fairer conditions for competition between industrialised and developing countries.

Taking these proposals seriously would solve a lot of problems.

Coastal Impact of Tourism

NGO Demands
The NGOs will begin with the special position of Small Island Developing States, where, in some cases, coastal and marine resources which are essential for their economic survival, have been destroyed. The NGOs believe that there should be integrated planning for tourism, which takes environmental, socio-cultural and economic factors into account. All public awareness and training must be accompanied by a public information campaign, and there must be integrated management of the coastal zones. Such an approach could foster community stewardship of the local environmental and culture, respect local culture and promote local ownership/
Golf Courses - a Green Issue in the Caribbean

Leroy Trotman, the head of the ICFTU delegation is also General Secretary of the Barbados Workers’ Union. He explained, yesterday, that as well as representing the ICFTU at the CSD, his special interest was that Barbados, because of its size, was very dependent on tourism, as a major money earner. Barbados has recently seen massive tourist growth. One of the growth areas for tourism has been golf courses which are springing up round the island, bringing their own problems.

A popular activity for the rich visitor to Barbados is golf. With companies advertising golf cruises round the Caribbean on the Internet, at only $1499 for seven days, this is clearly a past time for the richest up-market visitor. Who need not pay attention to the real surroundings, apart from enjoying the “warm crystalline waters”.

For further reading on GATS and Tourism, purchase “TOURISM AT THE CROSSROADS, Challenges to Developing Countries by the New World Trade Order.” The publication was written by Jorg Seifert-Granizin and Samuel Jesupatham, and is the product of a study project, initiated and commissioned by Tourism Watch, Germany and Equations, India, and is aimed at facilitating a constructive international debate on the impact of liberalisation in tourism. You can order from: Redaktion epd-Entwicklungspolitik Postfach 50 05 50 60394 Frankfurt/Main, Germany E-mail: epdep@epd.de

Barbados caught in a double bind

However, while accepting that this type of tourist development brings environmental problems, small island states like Barbados are caught in a double bind. As protections for their products, such as the Lome agreement, are cut from under them by free trade (as the banana dispute clearly illustrated), these states have to look for alternative sources of finance. With a beautiful countryside, blue sea, and weather which rich Northerners would die for, tourism is an obvious, swift option for diversification. So what are the answers? In Barbados they are using tripartite dialogues to stop potential ecological disasters.

“The Union has an exciting relation with the government and the private sector” was how Trotman described it. “We have tripartite consultation on issues of national development. In fact, at our last meeting I mentioned the proliferation of golf courses”.

Environmental research has shown that golf courses only retain one-fourth the amount of water of an equivalent forest area, as most rainwater simply runs off green and fairways. An addition problem is the use of fertilizers and pesticides to keep the fairways healthy, and insects at bay. These contain organic phosphorus, which are then absorbed by humans. High levels of mercury have also been found in lakes near golf courses. “This may be good for the golf ball, but it certainly isn’t good for the people who find chemicals in the water tables” commented Trotman.

Much of the money generated from this form of tourism does not go back to the local population either. Often the facilities are so expensive - usually courses provide cabins and chalets - that this is beyond the budget of all but the richest local entrepreneur. Since start-up costs run into the $100 millions, these facilities are run by outsiders. The government, which is keen to encourage economic development, reckons that the land can revert back to agricultural use in the long term.

Barbados caught in a double bind

For further reading on GATS and Tourism, purchase “TOURISM AT THE CROSSROADS, Challenges to Developing Countries by the New World Trade Order.” The publication was written by Jorg Seifert-Granizin and Samuel Jesupatham, and is the product of a study project, initiated and commissioned by Tourism Watch, Germany and Equations, India, and is aimed at facilitating a constructive international debate on the impact of liberalisation in tourism. You can order from: Redaktion epd-Entwicklungspolitik Postfach 50 05 50 60394 Frankfurt/Main, Germany E-mail: epdep@epd.de
Environmental Awareness: Green Globe

Green Globe is an environmental awareness and management program for travel and tourism companies and destinations. Originally established in 1994 by the World Travel & Tourism (WTTC). Its logo and global representation allows companies to be recognized internationally for their efforts in implementing environmental policies, improving environmental practices, and increasing environmental awareness.

Green Globe has three core programs: 1) a membership program, 2) a certification program and, 3) a destination program.

Certify Tourism
In 1997, Green Globe in partnership with SGS – the world's largest international verification agency – launched a certification program for environmentally sustainable travel and tourism. The certification program is based on the principles of Agenda 21 and incorporates the Environmental Management System requirements of ISO 14001 tailored specifically to the tourism industry. SGS performs certification assessments to verify compliance with the GREEN GLOBE standard. Certification costs start at an estimated US$750 per room for smaller hotels and are scaled higher for larger establishments.

The Destinations program provides an overall framework to guide locations towards achieving sustainable development. It is based on a participatory process, involving all stakeholders. Green Globe provides research, expertise, knowledge, and training and awareness to support efforts. A key benefit of the Green Globe Destination Program is to provide improved marketing efforts through Green Globe’s international marketing efforts, regular press, and media initiatives.

Global branding for big companies
GREEN GLOBE recognizes that achieving sustainability, as a tourism destination is a challenge. Tourism is multi-sectoral, but the impacts associated with tourism development process occur first and with the greatest intensity at the community level. Involving the community and all relevant stakeholders in planning is paramount. The focus is on prevention rather than on treating the symptoms.

Implementing the Green Globe program has widespread implications in many areas. But would it be encouraging a “passive” consumer as opposed to an “active” consumer? Should global standards be encouraged, or would individual, regional, or more nationally based certification programs be better? After all, “variety is the spice of life.” And who can afford it? Would global branding end up only being applicable to larger enterprises? Issues regarding reliability and effectiveness have been raised, as well as, it has been suggested that Business and Industry should provide guidance and not be directive, and possibly not be involved at all in spearheading such an initiative.

Green Globe works in partnership with other organizations; for example, Green Globe works with CAST and CTO in the Caribbean, and Green Seal in the US. Green Globe’s activities are designed to be self-sustaining and will source funding where needed. In Jamaica, four hotels were recently certified as part of a pilot project implemented by Hagler Bailey and co-funded by USAID. Consumer education is at the heart of the program, in that consumer education and greater awareness and the decisions made as to whether or not they choose a “Green Globe” certified destination or company is fundamental to program’s success.

Mountains: fragile and highly biodiverse

Mountain regions represent a significant portion of the tourism industry. These remote, fragile and highly bio-diverse ecosystems are homes to unique cultures and traditions that draw tourists from an increasingly urbanized world. As tourism increases in mountain regions around the world, environmental and social impacts can also be expected to increase.

Tourism with a potential improve
The potential for tourism to improve environmental conservation and community well-being is nevertheless considerable. The key to accessing this potential is the direct involvement of local communities within a climate of supportive regional or national policy. Policy makers, non-governmental organizations and practitioners of mountain tourism must therefore work to create opportunities that focus on local communities, promote conservation efforts and link conservation with enterprise development.

Focus on conservation
The constraints and assets unique to mountain areas pose a particular challenge to sustainable use. A focus on conservation and community integrity is essential if mountain tourism is to remain viable over the years to come. The development of tourism in mountain regions threatens to undermine the ecosystems and cultures.

To highlight the need to address sustainable tourism issues specific to mountain areas, the Swiss delegation hosted a special side event on Tuesday, April 20, 1999 to address various issues facing mountain tourism with case studies from fifteen countries.

Jason Espie and Ryan Bidwell, The Mountain Institute
Norwegian NGO with bold initiative

The Norwegian Forum for Environment and Development want the Military Sector's production and consumption of goods on the CSD Agenda. The key issues are the following:

- The badly controlled, uncomplicated, nearly unrestricted access to weapons is the trigger of wars and keeps them going. There were 28 different wars in 1998 and certainly no fewer today.

- The total production and consumption of military goods has not decreased since 1992. The trend is rather the opposite. The lives of the people in many countries are increasingly threatened by excessive quantities of weapons.

- Consequently, the production and consumption of today's weapons and other military products directly and indirectly affect development and environment in many parts of the world.

- No authoritative, effective national or international organs or systems have brought this unacceptable and ungraceful state of affairs under control. Instruments for accountable reporting and control with trade and transfer of weapons have failed.

- Many parts of the world seem to be exposed to a "military regime" that needs to be analysed and assessed in relation to sustainable development.

- But the constant, abundant supply of weapons is the destabilising factor in many countries; it blocks their way out of poverty and threatens the environment.

No shortcuts

Military production and consumption cannot be cut out instantaneously. In a transition period, national defence will be dependent on military defence. But the essence is to have this dependence radically reduced within a short time through gradual but substantial reduction of military production and the weapon stockpile. This is no easy undertaking.

Political will and initiative is required to bring this process forward through necessary measures. Then the role of the weapons in conflict solution has to be taken over by a non-violent system of conflict resolution, supported and undertaken by the United Nations.

Environment to address militarism:

CSD 7 could come to a decision that "Military Production and Consumption of Goods" is placed on the agenda and given major focus during the next summit in 2002. The Commission could make this decision based on the close connection between the present production/use of weapons and sustainable development.

Agenda 21, Principles 24-26, and the Report of the Brundtland Commission "Our Common Future"; chapter 11 urges this to be done.

In the sustainable development and environment context, the question raised above are looked upon as vital and urgent by the Commission. These challenges will be highlighted at the side event hosted by the Norwegian Forum for Environment and Development in CR-8 from 6:15-8:00 p.m. today.

Where is Education this year?

Last year, the Education Caucus was extremely active. The caucus had convened a workshop on the role of the CSD in relation to education for sustainable development in December 1997 at the Thessaloniki International Conference on Education. As a result, the work of the CSD and its relevance for Education and most importantly, how to participate in the work of the CSD, reached a much wider audience than would have been the case.

Zehra Aydin of the CSD, presented a paper to CSD6 illustrating the contribution that the major groups were making towards education for sustainable development. Two case studies were provided from each of the nine major groups.

But where is education this year? The Education Caucus will try to trace education at CSD 7 through a number of small articles in the following days and ask a basic question: Why is education not a major group?

NGO statements and caucus position papers!

Please help us update our NGO library by submitting all the documents and statements produced by the caucuses. It’s very important for future work that we keep records of our participation and intervention. We appreciate receiving copies of other documents you consider important for the library.

Documents may be handed to:
The Northern Clearinghouse
Carine Wilhelmsen
Conference Room A
Roadmap to 2002 – Guiding You through the Sustainable Maze

Receiving its international launch at the 7th Session of the Commission on Sustainable Development, the Roadmap to 2002 web-site represents UNED-UK’s agenda setting towards Earth Summit III. Designed to track the international agenda of Sustainable Development Issues, the Roadmap will be presented in the Learning Centre from 5-6pm this afternoon.

The purpose of the Roadmap is to bring together the work being done on each of the selected issues under one common forum, to aid preparations and access more informed participation into the U.N. system.

The Framework of the web-site outlines the structure of the U.N. system, providing executive summaries and links to the key U.N. and international agencies charged with leading the Sustainable Development Agenda. The interactive Issues section deals with each issue individually, and focuses down on the events, conferences and meetings that have shaped the debate since the 1st Earth Summit in 1992. Links are given to the outcome texts of those meetings to access the way the negotiations have developed.

Part of the current phase of the project involves expert analysis from representatives of the main sectors on each of the issues. This process will explore the implications to each sector of the moves being made on their specific issue. By doing this we hope to bring perspective to the agreements being met.

The Roadmap is currently online at: www.uned-uk.org/roadmap and covers each of the issues under debate at the CSD this year. For more information contact: Toby Middleton (tel: +44 171 839 1784)

Indigenous Peoples & Tourism: An Opportunity to Contribute

Indigenous peoples have identified tourism as one of the major threats to their cultures and to the biodiversity within their homelands. Ecotourism is of particular concern since it is used as a marketing tool to specifically target indigenous homelands where high biodiversity remains due to sophisticated traditional knowledge systems refined and applied over millennia.

Ecotourism – also a threat
Ecotourism, like other forms of market driven tourism, is with few exceptions exploitative of indigenous peoples; however, it often goes a step further and involves high visitation to remote areas in which the local indigenous community is too isolated to make informed decisions or effectively challenge unauthorized business practices. The community’s cultural and physical survival are jeopardized, as is the ecosystem balance actively maintained over thousands of years. According to the Centre for Tourism Research & Development in India the average ecotourism destination loses its unique features within 15 years.

CSD could be a useful backdrop
The Indigenous Peoples Development Network (“IPDN”), comprised of 20 member organizations across five continents has initiated a comprehensive program of analysis to determine how the indigenous right to self-determination can be realized in the tourism sector. The policy discussions underway within different United Nations policy fora like the Commission on Sustainable Development provide a useful backdrop to these discussions, bringing more transparency to industry activities. Nonetheless, the IPDN is concerned about the limited range and depth of questioning in such dialogue processes. Questions with regard to the rights of indigenous peoples do not have prominence in the agenda, nor is there a proper mechanism for indigenous involvement.

Mechanisms to control tourism
Indigenous initiatives to develop protective mechanisms for the control of tourism within their traditional territories point to a fundamental problem with current notions of sustainable tourism. Hard questions need to be asked if the tourism industry is to have credibility among indigenous peoples. How do we move from exploitative terms of trade to partnerships? Can self-determination be realized within a stakeholder process?

These issues and other pressing matters will be debated at the side event on the Role of Indigenous Peoples & Local Communities in Tourism co-hosted by the IPDN and the International Support Group for Sustainable Tourism at 6:15 p.m. on Wednesday, April 21 in Conference Room A. Please join us to explore some concrete options and solutions.
**Appeal for cases of sustainability success at CSD-7**

An appeal has been made for case studies of successful examples of sustainable consumption working at local levels. This can be showcased at special side event at CSD-7 on Thursday evening (April 22). It comes from the organisers of a major international conference on consumption scheduled for the UK this coming September.

**Conference at Southampton**

Delegates attending Down to Earth at Southampton, Hampshire, will be encouraged to identify the causes of over consumption... not simply the symptoms. The aim of the three day conference is to get like minded people from stakeholder groups – local and central governments; NGOs; business and academia - to exchange ideas and best practices.

**Develop a realistic plan**

Participants will leave Down to Earth hopefully with a realistic action plan to take back to their organisations. At the CSD-7 on Thursday evening in Conference Room 2, Down to Earth wants to showcase successful case studies of sustainable consumption working at local levels. Chaired by Chip Lindner, a member of the International Board and former secretary of the Brundtland Commission, a number of speakers will relate their experiences. Among them will be John Gummer, chairman of the Oxford Commission on Sustainable Development and former UK Secretary of State for the Environment.

Down to Earth is organised by Project Integra, a co-operative of the local authorities of Hampshire along with a private waste contractor, Hampshire Waste Services. Project Director Bob Lisney said: “I can’t emphasise enough that we aim to give people the opportunity to take things into their own hands. Local initiatives are crucial and I look forward to hearing from people on Thursday. The whole Down to Earth philosophy is about making a bridge from the international debate to the implementation at a local level.”

CONTACTS: Bob Lisney Crowne Plaza Hotel 212-986-8800

---

**Al Gore is in town today and is faced with a tough decision between meeting Environment Ministers at the CSD or major donors at a fundraiser at the Sheraton. No choice!**

It was overheard at the launch of the Earth Centre in the UK given Rt. Hon. Chris Smith MP Secretary of State for Media, the Arts and Sport that a UK Ambassador to Washington was telephoned by the press to ask what he would want for xmas. Not to seem greedy, he said a bottle of preserved fruits. Two weeks later he opened the newspaper to find a centre spread on what UK ambassadors want for xmas. It read: The Russian Ambassador wanted world peace; the French Ambassador wanted peace in the Middle East; the German Ambassador wished for a better environment and the UK Ambassador, a bottle of preserved fruits!

Delegates are enthusiastic about the array of different colored NGO diaries. Rumor has it there is an informal trading system set up. One yellow copy will get you onto the second floor during the high-level segment, two will get you into the delegate’s lounge. One purple copy will get you high, a couple will get you thrown out. Green diaries are especially valuable for government delegates as they give their ministers an additional minute in the high-level segment. A red copy is your ticket to all the best receptions, and will be the color of your eyes the following morning!
### Wednesday’s program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:45 - 9:15 am</td>
<td>Women’s Caucus, doors open at 8:30 am</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:15 am</td>
<td>NGO Briefing Session NGO Steering Committee</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 am - 1 pm</td>
<td><strong>Official Session</strong>: Dialogue Segment on Tourism. Topic: Coastal Impact of Tourism</td>
<td>CR-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 - 11 pm</td>
<td>Caucus meetings Sustainable Production and Consumption Caucus (SPAC)</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 - 12 pm</td>
<td>Corporate Accountability Caucus</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 - 1 pm</td>
<td>Human Settlements Caucus</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 am - 1 pm</td>
<td><strong>Learning Center</strong>: Presentation on Copernicus</td>
<td>CR-B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 - 2:45 pm</td>
<td>Side event: Factor 4 and Factor 10 in the Nordic Countries, Nordic Council of Ministers</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 - 2:45 pm</td>
<td>Side event: Shrimp Sentinel Natural Resources Defense Council</td>
<td>CR-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 - 2:45 pm</td>
<td>Side event: Presentation on the UK-UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Center Initiative</td>
<td>CR-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 - 2:45 pm</td>
<td>Side event: Presentation of DESA’s Technical Cooperation Services DESA</td>
<td>Dag Hammarvikjold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 - 2:45 pm</td>
<td>Side event: Trade Union Meeting</td>
<td>Church C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 - 2:45 pm</td>
<td><strong>Caucus meeting</strong>: Tourism Caucus</td>
<td>Church C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15</td>
<td>Southern NGO Caucus Luncheon Meeting</td>
<td>U.N. Caf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15 - 2:45 pm</td>
<td>Northern NGO Caucus followed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - 3 pm</td>
<td>Youth Caucus</td>
<td>CR-B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - 6 pm</td>
<td><strong>Official Session</strong>: High Level Segment Topical focus: Tourism and Sustainable Development</td>
<td>CR-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 - 4:30 pm</td>
<td>NGO Ocean Caucus meeting: Preparation for High Level Segment</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 6 pm</td>
<td><strong>Learning Center</strong>: Roadmap to 2002</td>
<td>CR-B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 pm</td>
<td>US Government Briefing for all NGOs</td>
<td>Church C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:15 - 8 pm</td>
<td>Side event: A European Community Strategy to Support the Development of Sustainable Tourism in the Developing Countries. European Union</td>
<td>CR-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:15 - 8 pm</td>
<td>Side event: Role of Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities in Tourism Indigenous Peoples’ Development Network</td>
<td>CR-A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SUBMISSIONS TO OUTREACH

OUTREACH will be produced daily during CSD VII. NGO representatives are invited to submit articles and announcements via the following:

1) E-MAIL: northclear@csdngo.org
2) Labelled 3.5 diskette. Drop off (preferably with print out) at DC2-1764 (Two UN Plaza, 17th Floor).

Feature articles should be NO LONGER than 450 words. Information articles should not exceed 250 words. Deadline for announcements is 4:00 p.m. and deadline for articles is 6:30 p.m. The editorial staff reserves the right to shorten/omit submissions.